



Clark, William

Academic Charisma and the Origins of the Research University

Chicago: University of Chicago Press
662 pp., \$45.00, ISBN 0-226-10921-6
Publication Date: January 2006

How nice for academics to think of ourselves as charismatic. That may be stretching William Clark's title, but he is examining the academic mystique. And we are at least charismatic in our own minds, hearing approval for our lectures and recognition of our research. Clark has written, in his own words, an "odd book" that examines in minute detail and sweeping generalizations the emergence of the academic culture that most of us absorb in graduate school as our identity and value system.

Clark begins by questioning our founding myth that the research university dates from the Humboldtian post-Napoleonic reforms. He carefully makes the case that the changes in the German-speaking world predate the resistance to the Napoleonic political and academic order. Clark depicts the German (Prussian-Hanoverian) university as a creation of market forces and of the bureaucracy operating in the intellectual world of the Enlightenment and Romanticism. Central to his case is that the fundamental pieces of the "German" university were already in place by 1789, rather than 1815.

By 1789 a "star" system had already developed in Prussia and Hanover in which academics' scholarly fame had become a valuable commodity to universities and government ministries. Clark switches Humboldt's role from that of initiator of a new type of university to the author of an intellectual rationale for what already existed. In place of the perception that succeeding bureaucrats perverted Humboldt's *bildung*, Clark maintains that he expected the university to be intimately tied to the state.

Clark begins by examining the triumph of the written over the oral academic culture. The previous dominance of those who excelled in the lecture and disputation, the heritage of the medieval university, was eclipsed in the Enlightenment. Although the lecture survived as a teaching technique, written work became the coin of the new academic realm. Written examinations, seminar papers, dissertations, the doctorate, and peer-reviewed scholarship became the road to academic success. Symbolically the library catalogue replaced the lecture catalogue as the most important academic record, the author's charisma superseded the speakers'. Such written documentation fit the demands of rising bureaucrats in the German-speaking world who exerted a power over academics that was unimaginable in the English-

speaking world, whose Oxbridge tradition placed tenured professors beyond discipline.

This ambitious book connects material culture and minute investigations to the sweeping interpretations of Weber, Foucault, and others. The growing historiographic tendency to find greater continuity between ancien and new regime western Europe here finds its voice for higher education. And the conclusion hints at the literature showing how the international borrowing of ideas such as "the German university" was perverted by the perceptions of the borrowers.

This impressive effort is densely (although playfully and sometimes humorously) written and long. Reflecting the modern academic culture whose origins it dissects, only a small number of specialists in intellectual history and history of higher education will fight their way through it. Those who do will be well rewarded.

W. BRUCE LESLIE

SUNY at Brockport

Copyright © 2006 Heldref Publications

Winter, Jay, and Antoine Prost

The Great War in History: Debates and Controversies, 1914 to the Present

New York: Cambridge University Press
250 pp., \$70.00 cloth, \$28.99 paper
ISBN 0-521-85083-5 cloth
ISBN 0-521-61633-6 paper
Publication Date: July 2005

Jay Winter, formerly of Cambridge University and now at Yale, is the authority on Britain's experience in World War I and a pioneer in developing a cultural history of the war. Antoine Prost, emeritus professor at the University of Paris, is an equally prominent French historian of the war. Their collaboration has produced an ambitious effort to assess the historiography of the war from its inception to the present, focused mainly on the French, British, and German accounts.

Winter and Prost organize the book topically and chronologically. They posit three historiographical "configurations" which they then employ as an organizational scheme throughout. The first configuration they see beginning during the war, lasting until World War II, and characterized largely by diplomatic and military history, the effort to understand how the war began and to record the ways in which it was fought. This was history from above, the perspective of politicians, diplomats, and generals. The second configuration emerged in the 1960s, after the pause in WWI studies induced by WWII. Here the focus shifted to the experience of the soldiers at the front and the civilians at home, masses rather than elites, social history often with a strong Marxist dimension, especially in France. The third configuration emerged seamlessly out of the second in the 1990s and broadened the focus to include memory and sensibility. In this debate war and its cost was

constructed by the participants, a form of cultural history, with individuals taking center stage. The authors conclude there is no reconciling these three forms of history. They consider each form to be legitimate, but also inadequate, to capture the full magnitude of the war experience. They also conclude that, in spite of much common experience both at the front and at home, French, German, and British perceptions of the war trap their respective historiographies in the traditional national framework. But the great strength of this book lays in the contrasts revealed by such comparisons. All except specialists in WWI studies will be enlightened and often surprised by how differently Frenchmen, Germans, and Britons think about the same war.

This is a book for historians, students, and serious buffs. It is as much about the nature of historical inquiry as it has evolved in twentieth century Britain, France, and Germany as it is about various interpretations of the meaning of the war. This kind of comparative analysis over such a huge and varied literature is rare, perhaps unprecedented, and certainly welcome. A rich and fascinating book, it deserves a wide readership.

R. D. CASSELL

Emeritus, University of North Carolina at Greensboro

Copyright © 2006 Heldref Publications

Hendrickson, Ryan C.

Diplomacy and War at NATO: The Secretary General and Military Action after the Cold War

Columbia: University of Missouri Press
172 pp., \$34.95 cloth, \$16.95 paper
ISBN 978-0-8262-1664-9 cloth
ISBN 978-0-8262-1635-9 paper
Publication Date: March 2006

In *Diplomacy and War at NATO*, Ryan C. Hendrickson, an associate professor of political science at Eastern Illinois University, studies the first four post-cold war secretaries general of the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO)—Manfred Wörner, Willy Claes, Javier Solana, and George Robertson. Using a comparative case study approach, he looks at each secretary's role in what he calls critical "use of force decisions," instances when NATO either considered or implemented military action. He employs an assessment model that evaluates leadership in three different forums—the systemic level, the organizational level, and the level of the civil-military relationship. At the systemic level, Hendrickson tests both how the secretaries general shaped the international political agenda at the time and how the international political system affected their actions. Here, he shows how NATO member states, especially the United States, defined the parameters of the alliance's engagement in international affairs. At the organizational level, mainly the deliberations of the North Atlantic Council (NAC), he describes how each man brought a different

Copyright of History: Reviews of New Books is the property of Heldref Publications and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.